

## TEXAS APPRAISER LICENSING & CERTIFICATION BOARD

# Texas Appraiser Licensing & Certification Board

**Complaint Overview Handbook** 

December 2024

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

A. Introduction to Complaint Processing by TALCB	3
Who does TALCB Regulate?	3
Basic Complaint Requirements	3
Filing Complaints	4
B. Initial Processing of Complaints	4
Is the Complaint Signed?	4
	4
Should the Complaint be Abated?	4
C. Opening a Complaint	5
Complaint Intake	5
•	5
Complaint Notice	5
D. Complaint Response	5
Complaint Response & Request for Extension	5
	6
Complaint Prioritization	6
•	
	7
. •	8
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	8
Non-disciplinary Dismissals	8
• •	8
	9
	9
	9
Agreed Final Order	10
Notice of Violation and Penalty	10
	10
	11
G. Alternative Dispute Resolution	11
Investigative Conference	11
Negotiation	
Mediation	12

#### A. Introduction to Complaint Processing by TALCB

#### Who does TALCB Regulate?

The Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board ("TALCB" or "the Board") regulates professional appraisal service providers in Texas, including:

- Certified General Appraisers
- Certified Residential Appraisers
- Licensed Residential Appraisers
- Appraiser Trainees
- Appraiser Continuing Education Providers
- Temporary Practice Permits
- Appraisal Management Companies

These professionals are required to have a license, approval, or certificate issued by the Board in order to engage in appraisal practice or provide appraiser continuing education. A person may file a complaint with TALCB against any of these appraisal service providers if the person believes an appraisal service provider violated: the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice ("USPAP"), the Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Act and/or the Texas Appraisal Management Company Registration and Regulation Act (collectively, the "Act") and Board Rules as enumerated in the Texas Administrative Code. On its own motion, the Board may file a complaint against an unlicensed real estate appraisal or real estate appraisal management company ("AMC").3

#### **Basic Complaint Requirements**

To investigate a complaint, the Board must have:

- 1. a signed complaint;
- 2. jurisdiction; <sup>4</sup>
- 3. probable cause to believe that a violation exists; and
- 4. the alleged violation must have occurred within the previous four years. 4

A complaint must be signed because the Board cannot investigate anonymous complaints. The complaint must contain sufficient allegations of conduct that if true, would actually be a violation of the laws the Board enforces.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Sections 1103.153, 1103.201 & 1104.101, Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code §§ 153, 155, 157, & 159.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Sections 1103.451(b)(2) & 1104.204(b)(3), Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Sections 1103.452(d)(1) & 1103.451(e), Texas Occupations Code.

#### Filing Complaints

Complaints must be submitted in writing. Complaints and supporting documents can be submitted through our <u>Online Complaint Portal</u>. If you are having trouble submitting, please contact TALCB at <u>enforcement.talcb@talcb.texas.gov</u>. TALCB staff or Board members may also file a complaint, and staff will conduct investigations as necessary to enforce the Act and Board Rules.<sup>5</sup>

#### B. Initial Processing of Complaints

All complaints received by the TALCB are assigned a complaint number and are then reviewed for basic requirements through the complaint intake process. During the intake process, the legal support staff and staff attorneys determine the following:

#### Is the Complaint Signed?

The TALCB cannot investigate anonymous complaints.<sup>6</sup> Complaints that do not include a signature are immediately returned to the sender with a request for signature. If the complaint is signed and staff determines TALCB has jurisdiction over the subject matter and the persons who are the subject of the complaint, the complaint will be opened.<sup>7</sup> A person who files a complaint is a "complainant." The complainant will receive an e-mail acknowledging that the complaint has been opened or explaining why a complaint was not opened.

#### What if the TALCB does not have Jurisdiction?

Complaints regarding matters outside the jurisdiction of the TALCB are closed. For example, complaints solely disputing value or relating to business practices do not fall under the Board's jurisdiction. Staff may request additional information from any person, if necessary, to determine how to proceed with the complaint resolution. If TALCB staff determines at any time the Board lacks jurisdiction over the allegations in the complaint, staff will dismiss the complaint. If the Board has jurisdiction over the complaint, the complaint will be opened.

#### Should the Complaint be Abated?

The Board has adopted a policy to abate, or suspend investigation of, any complaints that are involved in litigation or have been referred to the Texas Workforce Commission due to allegations of discrimination or bias against a protected class. These complaints will be abated until the matter is resolved. When a case is abated, TALCB will send notice of the abatement to the respondent and the complainant. TALCB will also instruct the respondent to maintain a true, correct, and complete work file, appraisal reports, and any other records connected with the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Sections 1103.451(b) and 1104.204(b), Texas Occupations Code

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(a) & § 159.204(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(a)(1)-(2) & § 159.204(a)(1)-(2)

<sup>8 22</sup> Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(c)(1); § 159.204(c).

appraisal activity that is the subject of the complaint until notified by TALCB. Staff periodically reviews the status of abated cases. Once the matter is resolved, TALCB will lift the abatement and begin investigating the complaint.

#### C. Opening a Complaint

#### **Complaint Intake**

If the complaint and supporting documents meet all of the basic requirements, the complaint is opened for investigation.

#### Who Must Respond to a Complaint?

The "respondent" is the person(s) who is (are) the subject(s) of the complaint. If TALCB determines additional information from the respondent is required, TALCB may send notice of the complaint to the respondent's e-mail address on file with TALCB.

#### **Complaint Notice**

The notice of complaint includes:

- 1. Instructions on how and when to submit a response;
- 2. Complaint Questionnaire form;
- 3. Copy of the complaint filed, which will be redacted to the extent possible to protect the identity of the complainant;<sup>9</sup>
- 4. All supporting documents filed with the complaint; and
- 5. Copy of TALCB Complaint Process & Resolution Overview

#### D. Complaint Response

#### Complaint Response & Request for Extension

Each respondent from whom a response is requested must submit a response within 20 days of receiving notice of the complaint. The 20-day period may be extended for good cause upon request in writing or by e-mail.<sup>10</sup> The response must include the following:

- 1. A copy of the appraisal report that is the subject of the complaint;
- 2. A copy of the respondent's work file associated with the appraisal(s) listed in the complaint, with the following signed statement attached to the work file(s):

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Sections 1103.460(d-1) and 1104.2082(e-1), Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(j); § 159.204(h).

- For Appraisers: "I SWEAR AND AFFIRM THAT EXCEPT AS SPECIFICALLY SET FORTH HEREIN, THE COPY OF EACH AND EVERY APPRAISAL WORK FILE ACCOMPANYING THIS RESPONSE IS A TRUE AND CORRECT COPY OF THE ACTUAL WORK FILE, AND NOTHING HAS BEEN ADDED TO OR REMOVED FROM THIS WORK FILE OR ALTERED AFTER PLACEMENT IN THE WORK FILE"; or
- For AMCs: "I SWEAR AND AFFIRM THAT EXCEPT AS SPECIFICALLY SET FORTH HEREIN, THE COPY OF EACH AND EVERY BUSINESS RECORD ACCOMPANYING THIS RESPONSE IS A TRUE AND CORRECT COPY OF THE ACTUAL BUSINESS RECORD, AND NOTHING HAS BEEN ADDED TO OR REMOVED FROM THIS BUSINESS RECORD OR ALTERED";
- 3. A narrative response to the complaint, addressing each and every item in the complaint;
- 4. A list of any and all persons known to the respondent to have actual knowledge of any of the matters made the subject of the complaint and, if in the respondent's possession, their contact information;
- 5. Any documentation that supports the respondent's position that was not in the work file (for appraisers) or original documentation (for AMCs), as long as it is conspicuously labeled as such and kept separate from the work file or original documentation. Respondents may also address other matters not raised in the complaint that the respondent believes need explanation.
- 6. A signed, dated, and completed copy of any questionnaire sent by Board staff. 11

Once the response is received, the case manager will assign the complaint to an investigator.

#### E. Complaint Investigation

#### **Complaint Prioritization**

The Board prioritizes complaints based on the risk of harm each complaint poses to the public. <sup>12</sup> Complaints that pose a high risk of public harm include violations of the Act or Board Rules that:

- 1. Evidence serious deficiencies, including:
  - a. Fraud;
  - b. Identity theft;
  - c. Unlicensed activity;
  - d. Ethical violations;
  - e. Violations of appraiser independence; or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(j)(1)-(6); § 159.204(h)(1)-(6).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(b); § 159.204(b).

- f. Other conduct determined by the Board to pose a significant risk of public harm; and
- 2. Were done
  - g. with knowledge;
  - h. deliberately;
  - i. willfully; or
  - j. with gross negligence.<sup>13</sup>

TALCB staff performs an initial evaluation of the complaint to determine whether the case might warrant dismissal; or there is evidence of a potential violation that might warrant disciplinary action.

If at any time TALCB staff determines the complaint allegations might present a high risk of public harm, staff will escalate the complaint and expedite the investigation and resolution process, which may include a temporary suspension hearing if there is evidence of a continuing threat to the public welfare.<sup>14</sup> Complaints alleging mortgage fraud or in which mortgage fraud is suspected may be investigated covertly and will be referred to the appropriate prosecutorial authorities.<sup>15</sup>

If the investigator and staff attorney determine that no violation exists, the complaint is dismissed, and the respondent and complainant are notified.

#### Formal Notice & Periodic Notice

Parties will receive formal notice of complaint consistent with Board Rules, and periodic updates regarding the complaint status by e-mail every 90 days until final disposition.<sup>16</sup>

#### **Complaint Investigation**

The investigator reviews each complaint to ensure compliance with the USPAP, the Act, and Board Rules. During the investigation, the investigator might need to gather additional information. The investigator may request an investigative conference with the respondent to have a discussion of the facts and circumstances of the alleged violations. The investigative conference is discussed in more detail below. Once the investigation is complete, the investigator prepares a written investigative report and makes a recommended disposition based on the factors enumerated in Board rules and the Board's penalty matrix.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(b); § 159.204(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Sections 1103.5511 & 1104.211, Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(f); § 159.204(d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(h); Section 1103.163(c), Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.241; § 159.204(m).

#### Peer/AMC Investigative Committee Review

For Appraisers, in any case in which a contingent dismissal or discipline is recommended by an investigator, the complaint is subject to review by a Peer Investigative Committee ("PIC") comprised of two Board members and an investigator. The investigative report and the complaint file must be submitted to the PIC within seven days of completion of the report. The report must include a statement of facts, the investigator's recommendation, and the position or defense of the respondent. Within five additional days, the PIC must present to the Commissioner its determination agreeing or disagreeing with the investigator's recommendation. The determination also serves as a recommendation to TALCB staff on whether to pursue adverse action against the respondent.<sup>18</sup>

For AMCs, in any case in which a contingent dismissal or discipline is recommended by an investigator, the complaint and investigative report are subject to a similar review as described above, subject to the same deadlines, by an AMC Investigative Committee comprised of one or two Board members; a member of the AMC advisory committee; and an investigator.<sup>19</sup>

#### F. Complaint Disposition

After the investigation is complete, the complaint is referred to the Board's legal staff for review and disposition. A staff attorney reviews the complaint, the response (if requested) from the respondent, the investigative report and findings, and all other relevant information to determine whether a violation of USPAP, Board Rules, or the Act has occurred. If the staff attorney determines that a violation has occurred, the staff attorney makes a recommendation to the TALCB Director on the appropriate remedy for the violation. When making a recommendation for disposition, the staff attorney considers the factors enumerated in Board Rules and ensures the recommendation is consistent with the Board's penalty matrix.<sup>20</sup> A complaint may be resolved through a non-disciplinary method (which results in a dismissal) or through formal discipline.

#### Non-disciplinary Dismissals

#### **Dismissal**

The complaint may be dismissed if the investigation shows that: the incident is outside the jurisdiction of the Board; no violation occurred; there is insufficient evidence to prove a violation occurred; the complaint involves first- or second-time minor deficiencies.<sup>21</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 159.202.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.241; § 159.204(m)(3)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.241(3)(A) and § 153.241(3)(D); § 159.204(m)(3)(A) and § 159.204(3)(D)

#### Dismissal with Non-Disciplinary Warning Letter

If the investigation uncovers minor or serious deficiencies that warrant a warning, the investigator will prepare a written summary of the case that includes the allegations, the response to the allegations, the investigator's findings, and the investigator's recommendation for resolution. Warning letters can be used as evidence if a similar situation arises in the future.<sup>22</sup>

#### **Contingent Dismissal**

If the investigation uncovers violations of USPAP, the Act, or Board Rules, the investigator completes a written investigative report and a disposition factor analysis worksheet to determine the proper disposition of the complaint.<sup>23</sup> The Board's penalty matrix provides for disposition through contingent dismissal<sup>24</sup> for complaints with minor deficiencies under certain circumstances. A contingent dismissal is also available for serious deficiencies if the respondent has no prior formal discipline, unless the deficiencies were done with knowledge, deliberately, willfully, or with gross negligence.

A contingent dismissal is not available as an outcome once the case has proceeded to a contested case hearing at the State Office of Administrative Hearings ("SOAH").<sup>25</sup> If the investigator finds that the identified deficiencies can be remedied through education or mentorship, the investigator will include the recommendation in the disposition factor analysis worksheet. Once the investigation is complete, the complaint is referred to the Board's legal staff for review.

The staff attorney will review the complaint file and conduct a legal analysis to determine if disposition through contingent dismissal is appropriate. If the staff attorney finds that a contingent dismissal is warranted, the staff attorney will make a recommendation to the TALCB Director. If the Director approves the recommendation, the staff attorney will present the offer to the respondent.

#### **Disciplinary Action**

If the investigation uncovers (1) minor deficiencies coupled with certain aggravating circumstances or (2) serious deficiencies, the investigator may recommend formal discipline to include any of the below sanctions as a means to resolve the complaint:<sup>26</sup>

#### 1. Remedial measures;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.241(2)(A); § 159.204(m)(2)(A)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.24(n); §159.204(l).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.241(3); § 159.204(m)(3).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Sections 1103.518 & 1104.214, Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 153.241(3); § 159.204(m)(3).

- 2. Required adoption of written preventative policies or procedures;
- 3. Probationary period with provisions for monitoring an appraiser or AMC;
- 4. Restrictions on supervising trainees;
- 5. Restrictions on scope of practice;
- 6. Administrative penalty;
- 7. Refund;
- 8. Period of suspension; or
- 9. Revocation.

The investigator will complete an investigative report and refer the complaint file to legal staff for review. The staff attorney will make a recommendation for disposition and resolution to the TALCB Director. Upon approval by the Director, the staff attorney will present the offer to the respondent.

Formal disciplinary actions are resolved through Agreed Orders or through an order from the Board after a hearing at SOAH.

#### **Agreed Final Order**

An Agreed Final Order is entered when the respondent and the Board agree to specific disciplinary action to resolve the case.<sup>27</sup>

#### Notice of Violation and Penalty

If a respondent does not respond to a complaint and a response was required, the Board will send a Notice of Alleged Violation and Penalty to the respondent as a means to resolve the complaint matter. The Notice will set forth the parties, the alleged violations, and recommended sanctions and provide a conspicuous notice to the respondent about the right to a hearing and how to request a hearing. If the respondent does not respond and does not request a hearing in writing within 20 days, a Final Default Order imposing the recommended sanctions will be automatically entered against the respondent.<sup>28</sup>

#### Proposal for Decision – SOAH Hearing

If the Board and the respondent cannot reach an agreed resolution, the staff attorney will draft and file a Statement of Charges with SOAH and request a hearing to be scheduled. SOAH typically sets a hearing date 30-90 days from the date of the hearing request. Once the hearing is scheduled, TALCB sends a Notice of Administrative Hearing to the respondent.<sup>29</sup> Hearings are held before an administrative law judge ("ALJ") in SOAH's offices in Austin. The respondent may appear in person or may request to appear by teleconference. Within 60 days after the hearing, the ALJ will issue a Proposal for Decision

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Sections 1103.459 and 1104.2081, Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Sections 1103.5011 and 1104.209, Texas Occupations Code

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Sections 1103.502 and 1104.212, Texas Occupations Code.

("PFD"). The PFD includes the ALJ's findings of fact and conclusions of law.<sup>30</sup> Parties have a limited time to file exceptions to the PFD. If exceptions are filed, parties might have additional time to file a reply.<sup>31</sup> The ALJ will review any exceptions and replies that are filed by the parties and may revise the PFD based on the exceptions and replies.<sup>32</sup> The PFD is then presented to the Board for consideration at the next regularly scheduled Board meeting. The Board may adopt the PFD as written, make certain changes to the PFD, or remand the PFD to SOAH for further action by the ALJ.<sup>33</sup>

#### Failure to Appear – SOAH Hearing

If the respondent receives proper notice of a contested case hearing scheduled at SOAH but fails to appear at the hearing, the ALJ may either conduct the hearing or return the matter to the Board to enter a Default Order, as the ALJ finds appropriate. The respondent is bound by results of the Default Order as if the respondent appeared at the hearing.<sup>34</sup>

In addition, if the respondent fails to appear, the ALJ may award reasonable costs and attorney's fees, including but not limited to, preparation for the hearing, cost of discovery, witness expenses, investigative expenses, and SOAH expenses.<sup>35</sup> AMCs may be ordered to pay reasonable costs even after a fully litigated hearing.<sup>36</sup>

#### G. Alternative Dispute Resolution

To avoid the expense of litigation for both parties, the Board may also engage in three methods of alternative dispute resolution – investigative conferences, negotiations, and mediation.

#### **Investigative Conference**

The respondent may meet with the Board staff for an investigative conference. The purpose of the conference is to facilitate an investigative discussion of the facts and circumstances of the alleged violations. The investigative conference provides the respondent and staff an opportunity to address concerns revealed by the investigation. No later than three days before the date of the investigative conference, Board staff will provide the respondent with a Statement of Investigative Conference Procedures and Rights ("IC Form"), which should be reviewed, signed, and returned to Board staff before the conference begins. The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Sections 1103.518 and 1104.214, Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.507(b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> 1 Tex. Admin. Code § 155.507(c)-(d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 157.17(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Sections 1103.510(a)-(b) and 1104.2132(a)-(b), Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Sections 1103.523 & 1104.2132(c), Texas Occupations Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Section 1104.214(2)(G), Texas Occupations Code.

respondent may choose to have the investigative conference in person (at the Board's office in Austin, Texas), by telephone, by video conference, or in writing.<sup>37</sup>

The respondent or applicant may submit a written request for a copy of the investigative report. If the request is timely and the requestor signs the Board's confidentiality agreement regarding the report, staff will provide the report not later than 5 days prior to the conference.<sup>38</sup> Participation in an investigative conference is not mandatory and may be terminated at any time by either party.<sup>39</sup>

After the investigative conference, the Board staff may propose a settlement offer to the respondent or recommend that the complaint be dismissed. The respondent may accept, reject, or make a counteroffer to the proposed settlement not later than ten (10) days following the date of the investigative conference.<sup>40</sup>

#### **Negotiation**

The Board staff and the respondent may enter into an agreement for settlement at any time without engaging in an investigative conference. Negotiations may be conducted in person, by phone, or through written communications, including e-mail.<sup>41</sup> Any agreement must be in writing and adopted by both sides before it becomes effective.

#### Mediation

If the Board staff and the respondent are unable to reach an agreement through the investigative conference or negotiations, the parties may consent to mediation. With the consent of all parties, the Board staff will request a date and time for the mediation from SOAH, who will send notice of the mediation to the parties. The notice will identify the mediator and include the date, time, and place of the mediation. The parties attending the mediation must have authority to settle the complaint. Any agreement signed by the Board staff at mediation is subject to final approval of the Board. A respondent participating in mediation must pay one-half of the mediation fee directly to the Board before the date of mediation.<sup>42</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 157.31(a)-(b), (d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 157.31(e).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 157.31(f).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 157.31(h), (i).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 157.32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> 22 Tex. Admin. Code § 157.33.